

Community Participation in the Formation of Regional Regulations to Realize the Indonesian Welfare State

Wahyu Hindiawati¹

¹ Legal Studies Program, Faculty of Law, Wisnuwardhana University Malang, East Java, Indonesia.

Received : 27 February 2024

Revised : 27 February 2024

Accepted : 28 February 2024

Published : 28 February 2024

Corresponding Author:

Wahyu Hindiawati

Email:

wahyuhindia@gmail.com

Abstract: *The 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (UUD 1945), as the basic law, is a general agreement (consensus) of citizens regarding basic norms (grundnorm) and basic rules (grundgesetze) in state life. This agreement primarily concerns shared goals and ideals. Sovereignty is held by the people. People's active participation includes, among other things, political activities and government activities. Active participation from the people includes, among other things, decision making, implementation and monitoring of policies. It is from this large participation of the people that can create a government of the people, by the people, and for the people in order to realize prosperity. This research uses normative legal research methods or what is usually called normative legal research. Normative legal research is research carried out by analyzing or studying the laws and regulations that apply or are applied to a particular legal problem. The results and conclusions of this research are as follows: 1) In the formation of regional regulations, community aspirations are needed and of course balanced with community involvement, including 1. Involvement in drafting regional regulations; 2. Involvement in the process of discussing regional regulations; 3. Involvement in the implementation of regional regulations; 2) Implementation of regional regulations in realizing prosperity, namely regional regulations can be interpreted as community services at the provincial, district/city level. The government must be able to create development of community creativity in order to achieve shared prosperity.*

Keywords: *Community Participation, Regional Regulations, Welfare Law*

INTRODUCTION

The concept of a welfare state is closely related to social *policy*. In countries that adhere to the welfare state theory, there are steps or strategies and government efforts taken to improve the welfare of their citizens, including through social protection which includes social security in the form of social assistance and social insurance, as well as social safety nets. (social safety nets). There are five main areas in the welfare concept according to Spicker's explanation, namely: health, education, housing, social security and social work.¹

Welfare or well-being has four meanings, including the following: First, prosperity refers to a good human condition, where people are prosperous, healthy and peaceful. Second, prosperity is always connected with material profits or benefits (material measures) as a function of social welfare (formatively and substantively usually meaning economic health or economic well-being; Third, social welfare refers to the range of services to meet community needs. Fourth, in another review (such as a policy phenomenon in developed countries such as America), prosperous refers to the

¹Isbandi Rukminto Adi, Kesejahteraan sosial: pekerjaan sosial, pembangunan sosial, dan kajian pembangunan.

http://pustaka.fisip.unand.ac.id/index.php?p=show_detail&id=12374&keywords= diakses pada 01 Maret 2024 pada 16.25 WIB

financial aspects paid by the government to people who need financial assistance, including: citizens who cannot work or whose income cannot meet basic needs, wages paid below the poverty line. Apart from that, there are also special conditions such as people who are looking for work (unemployment) or other conditions such as the inability or obligation to support their family and look after their children. Because there are several cases in countries where funds are required to work, which is known as *workfare* .

In the concept of a state based on law, law can be interpreted functionally.² Functionally, law is ultimately understood or comprehended as a collection of values for state and social life. In connection with the implementation of good state administration, good values are used as input. In preparing a legal policy, the values that live in society are usually taken into account³. Indonesia is a rule of law (welfarestaat) country. The concept of a legal state combines the notions of popular sovereignty with legal sovereignty as a single unit⁴. In Indonesia, the concept of a rule of law is contained in Article 1 paragraph (3) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, which states that Indonesia is a rule of law⁵. The meaning of Indonesia as a country of law has the consequence that law is used as the basis for every administration and state

life. The history of the founding of the Indonesian state greatly influenced the goals of the Indonesian state. The goals of the Indonesian state do not refer to the theory of state goals from Western Continental Europe which was initially aimed at seeking power alone, then developed into the goal of individual prosperity (liberalism).⁶ The objectives of the Indonesian state are stated in Paragraph 4 of the Preamble to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, including: 1) Protecting the entire nation and all of Indonesia's bloodshed; 2) Promote general welfare; 3) Making the nation's life smarter; 4) Participate in implementing world order based on independence, eternal peace and social justice. In achieving the goals of the Indonesian state, everything must be based on and measured by the values of Pancasila.⁷ Regarding the aim of protecting the entire nation and all of Indonesia's blood, it is the aim of uniting the entire Indonesian nation which is very heterogeneous. This means national unity without any differences in ethnicity, religion, race or group or often referred to as SARA.

The goal of protecting the entire Indonesian nation is actually a universal humanitarian goal. This is because the state not only protects all Indonesian citizens, but also all foreign citizens who are within the jurisdiction of the Indonesian state. This is in line with other universal humanitarian goals, namely contributing to the implementation of world order, based on freedom, eternal peace and social justice. All Indonesian

²Siti Sumartini, Nurwahyuni, Saeful Kholik. (2022). Kedudukan Hukum Dalam Persepektif Negara Hukum Modern. *Jurnal Suara Hukum* Vol.IV/No.2/2023, 226

³Asep Warlan Yusup. (2008). *Glorifying Just Law in the Realm of Just Democracy (In Points of Thought in Law; Commemorating 70 years of Prof. Dr. Arief Sidharta, SH)* . Bandung: Refika Aditama. Pg. 222.

⁴ Suko Wiyono. (2018). *Reactualization of Pancasila in National and State Life* . Malang: Wisnuwardhana University Malang Press. Pg. 108.

⁵ The 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia

⁶ Muhammad Tahir Azhary, (2010), *Suatu Studi Negara Hukum tentang Prinsip-Prinsipnya Dilihat dari Segi Hukum Islam : Implementasinya pada Periode Negara Madinah dan Masa Kini*, Kencana Prenada Media Group, Jakarta, hlm 97

⁷ Ratna Sari, Fatma Ulfatun Najicha, Memahami Nilai-Nilai Pancasila Sebagai Dasar Negara Dalam Kehidupan Masyarakat. *Jurnal Harmony* Vol.7/No.1/2022, 55

people must also unite in protecting and defending the territory of Indonesia as a unitary state.

In realizing the state's goals, participation from the community is also needed. Basically, participation is a concept in developing involvement of the general public and at large⁸. A democratic government certainly has community participation which is one of the prerequisites. Democracy will not be realized if the government system is not accompanied by participation and only relies on mobilization. There are several things that need to be improved in realizing good governance, namely as follows: information, accountability, protection of the community, as well as providing voting rights for parties most affected by public policy. One of the principles of *good governance* and a form of popular sovereignty is community participation in making public policies which is guaranteed in the constitution.

In the formation of laws, it is still felt that the form of accommodating public input is not transparent enough so that the public cannot participate optimally. The decision of the Constitutional Court (MK) on the material review of the Job Creation Law above clearly confirms this. The impact of meaningful participation in the judge's considerations in Constitutional Court Decision No. 91/PUU-XVIII/2020 is more or less accommodated in Article 96 of Law Number 13 of 2022 concerning the Second Amendment to Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations⁹. Community participation is carried out in the form of:

⁸Yahya Ahmad Yein, et al. (2016). *Legislative Drafting Legislative Drafting*. Yogyakarta: Thafa Media. Pg. 151.

⁹ Law Number 13 of 2022 concerning Second Amendment to Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations

public consultation, deliberation, partnership, conveying aspirations, monitoring; and/or other involvement in accordance with statutory provisions. In the formation of regional regulations, community involvement is one of the requirements in terms of fulfilling the aspirations of the community. This involvement includes, among other things, involvement in the process of discussing regional regulations. The process carried out before there is a discussion between the DPRD and the Regional Government is first, it is announced through the mass media which gives the public the opportunity to convey their aspirations. secondly, input from the public can be done orally, in writing or during meetings to discuss regional regulations. The agenda for the meeting to discuss regional regulations is completely in the hands of the DPRD and regional government whether to invite the public or let the discussion process proceed without community involvement.

METHODOLOGY

The research method used in this article is normative legal research, which is research carried out by examining the laws and regulations that apply or are applied to a particular legal problem. Normative research is often referred to as doctrinal research¹⁰ where the objects of the research are legal and regulatory documents and library materials¹¹.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Community Participation in the Formation of Regional Regulations

In the formation of regional regulations, cooperative participation between the people and the government is

¹⁰ Peter Mahmud Marzuki. (2007). *Legal Research*. Jakarta : Kencana Prenada Media Group. Pg. 32.

¹¹ Soerjono and H. Abdurahman. (2003). *Legal Research Methods*. Jakarta : Rineka Cipta. Pg. 56.

required in planning, implementing, preserving and developing development results¹². Meanwhile, according to Soerjono Soekanto in the sociology dictionary, " *participation* " is a process of identification and communication in joint activities¹³. The main concept and basic principle of participation is community development because among many things participation is closely related to the idea of community participation in various aspects including the formation of laws and regulations. Participation will also activate the idea of community rights, the right to participate in the formation of laws and regulations. As a process in community development, participation is related to the "right to be involved". The running of processes in participatory community development is a significant contribution of citizens, which is an expected and normal process in a decision-making effort. In the sense of participation, it is a means as well as an end, because it forms part of the cultural basis that paves the way for the achievement of the "right to be involved" for every citizen. According to Oakley et al. as in Jim Ife there is a comparison between participation as a means and as an end as follows:

PARTICIPATION AS A MEANS	PARTICIPATION AS A GOAL
1. A form of participation in achieving previously established goals or objectives.	1. A form of participation in order to empower the community to improve their own development.

2. An effort to utilize existing resources to achieve program objectives.	2. An effort to ensure an increased role of the people in development initiatives.
3. Prioritizes the goal rather than the participation activity itself.	3. Focus more on increasing people's ability to participate rather than just achieving predetermined project goals.
4. More common in government programs, the main consideration is to mobilize communities and involve them in improving the efficiency of the delivery system.	4. This view is relatively unpopular with government agencies. In principle NGOs agree with this view.
5. Vulnerable participation times are generally short term.	5. Participation is seen as a long-term process.
6. Participation is a way to make participation passive.	6. Participation as a goal is relatively more active and dynamic.

From the participation comparison table above, it can be seen that what is more dominant in providing and empowering the community is participation as a goal. Where, as mentioned, participation as a goal seeks to empower people to participate in their own development in a more meaningful way. Thus, this shows that this participation is not only limited to an ongoing program but is sustainable in a long-term process. Meanwhile, participation as a method only requires the program to run, but the

¹² Loekman Soetrisno. (1995). *Towards a Participatory Society* . Yogyakarta: Kanisius. Pg. 207.

¹³Soerjono Soekanto. (1993). *Sociology Dictionary* . Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada. Pg. 355.

community does not care whether it is good or not for the future and the process required in the short term.

Community participation in the formation of regional regulations (Perda) includes the following: 1) public consultation; 2) deliberation; 3) partnership; 4) conveying aspirations; 5) supervision; and/or 6) other involvement in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations.¹⁴ Community participation in the formation of this Regional Regulation is regulated in Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations which is clearly stated in Chapter XI regarding community participation in Article 96 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. In this Law, in principle, forms of community participation, especially those related to community rights to supervise the making of regional regulations, are more detailed. Technical regulations regarding the importance of community participation are specifically regulated in Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 120 of 2018 concerning the Formation of Regional Legal Products, community participation in the process of drafting regional regulations is regulated in Article 166 which states that the community has the right to provide oral and/or written input in the formation of Regional Regulations. , Perkada, PBKHD and/regional regulations. Input as intended can be done via; Public hearings; Work visit; Socialization; and/or Seminars, workshops, and/or discussions. The principle of public participation in the formation of laws has changed, the term meaningful participation has emerged in the consideration of Constitutional Justices

in the Constitutional Court Decision Number 91/PUU-XVIII/2020 concerning the formal review of Law Number 11 of 2020 on Job Creation.¹⁵ In order to realize public involvement, community participation needs to be carried out meaningfully (*meaningful participation*). This meaningful participation *is* a consideration of the Constitutional Court of Justice.

Regional regulations (perda) are regulatory instruments that are legally given to regional governments in carrying out government in the region. In the formation of Regional Regulations, regions as implementing regulations have not yet adopted the principle of *meaningful participation* , so there must be new implementing regulations or follow-up to Law 13 of 2022 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations which regulate the principle of *meaningful participation* in the formation of Regional Regulations.

Several laws have been in effect since 1945 until now as the legal basis for the administration of regional government by establishing regional regulations as one of the juridical instruments. The position and function of regional regulations are different from each other , contained in the UUD/Constitution and the Regional Government Law which is in line with the constitutional system. Apart from that, the arrangement of content material due to the narrow scope of affairs in the regional government is also a difference. Furthermore, changes in the pattern of relations between the central government and regional governments greatly influence the mechanisms for forming and monitoring the formation and implementation of regional regulations.

¹⁴ Dani R. Pinasang, Toar N. Palilingan. (2023). Penerapan Prinsip Partisipasi Masyarakat Bermakna (*Meaningful Participation*) Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah, *Lex Privatum* Vol.XI/No.2/2023, 5.

¹⁵ Helmi Chandra SY, Shelvin Putri Irawan, (2022). Expansion Meaning of Public Participation in the Formation of Laws After Decision of Constitutional Court, *Jurnal Konstitusi* Vol XIX/No.4/2022, 767

Positive legal rules such as the Regional Government Law, the Law on Legislation, implementing regulations which specifically regulate regional regulations must first be studied and mastered in drafting regional regulations. To draft a regional regulation, there are several things that must be well prepared by the regional regulation designer and must master the following things¹⁶: 1. Data analysis about the social problem that will be regulated. 2. Technical skills in legislation 3. Theoretical knowledge about the formation of regulations 4. Legislative law both in general and specifically regarding regional regulations. The process of forming regional regulations is carried out by the DPR and is discussed and discussed in depth with the regional heads to obtain agreement, consensus and approval, the results of which will later become legislative decisions that will be implemented in the region. There are several basic elements in the process of forming regional regulations, including: 1. Prior preparation process. In this process, preparations are made which will later be included as regional regulations. For example, completeness in creating and compiling papers about academics, papers about drafting regional regulations that apply in the relevant provincial regions. 2. Process for agreement, this process begins to collect agreements, consensus and agreement on the results of meetings, joint discussions and seminar results in the DPRD. 3. Approval validation process. In this process, an approval process is carried out which has received approval from the authorized parties, including the regional

secretary, regional government, legal bureau and regional heads in each provincial region, where the rules that have been approved in regional regulations are known to the regional community, which is related. According to Law no. 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations, Regional Regulations are divided into 2 parts, namely Provincial Regional Regulations and City/Regency Regional Regulations. The regional regulations themselves are included in the hierarchy of statutory regulations in Law no. 12 of 2011, is in Article 7 point f, and the City/Regency PERDA is in Article 7 point g. The process for forming Regional Regulations in Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations is as follows: 1. Planning Stage; 2) Preparation Stage; 3) Discussion Stage; 4) Determination Stage; 5) Invitation Stage; 6) Dissemination stage.

From the various explanations above, community involvement is very important to form regional regulations that can fulfill the aspirations of the community. This community involvement includes; 1. Involvement in drafting regional regulations. At this stage, the community can be involved in the drafting process in teams/working groups, involved in preparing academic texts, as well as submitting input delivered orally, in writing, or through mass media addressed to the initiator of regional regulations/teams.¹⁷ The current obstacle is the extent of transparency and commitment of relevant stakeholders, so that the public knows and can provide input on the agenda that is being and will be discussed. 2. Involvement in the process of discussing regional regulations. Discussion of regional regulations is

¹⁶Sarah Malena AD et al. (2023). Application of the Principle of Meaningful Community Participation in the Formation of Regional Regulations. *Lex Privatum* Vol.XI/No.2/Feb/2023, 7.

¹⁷ Praptanugraha, (2008). Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah, *Jurnal Hukum* Vol. XV/No.3/2008, 470

usually carried out by the DPRD and Regional Government. At this stage, before it is discussed, it should first be announced in the mass media to give the public the opportunity to convey their aspirations. Furthermore, in the discussion process the community can provide input verbally, in writing or during meetings to discuss regional regulations. Concerning attendance at meetings is indeed a dilemma, because it depends on the wishes of the DPRD and regional government whether to invite the public or let the discussion process proceed without community involvement. 3. Involvement in the implementation of regional regulations. Community involvement at this stage can be seen in how the community complies with regional regulations. Is it in line with aspirations, or is it the opposite, people feel disadvantaged or don't feel like their aspirations are being channeled. What the public can do if they feel they have been disadvantaged is by providing input to the institutions that make laws and regulations, and this can be used as material for consideration in making changes to or revoking these regulations. Apart from that, steps can also be taken through judicial review.

B. Implementation of Regional Regulations in realizing prosperity

The welfare state provides a greater role for the state (government) to allocate a portion of public funds to ensure the fulfillment of the basic needs of its citizens. This definition was initiated by Spicker in *Welfare State Theory*. The welfare state is aimed at providing social services for all its population, as best and wherever possible. Apart from that, the welfare state seeks to integrate resource systems and organize service networks that can maintain and improve the welfare of citizens in a fair and sustainable manner.

This means that a welfare state is the existence of a state, that the state government is considered responsible for guaranteeing a minimum standard of living welfare for every citizen¹⁸.

The concept of a welfare state is closely related to *social policy*. In various countries, the welfare state includes strategies and government efforts to improve the welfare of its citizens, including through social protection *which* includes social security in the form of social assistance and social insurance, as well as *social safety nets*. There are five main areas to explain the concept of welfare according to Spicker, namely: health, education, housing, social security and social work.

Relating to Implementation Regional regulations are said to serve the community, not to serve themselves.¹⁹ Both regional regulations in each province and each district/city. This means that local government services must be able to create conditions that make it possible to develop community creativity in order to achieve collective prosperity. The government must have competency standards, be democratic, responsive and adaptive in carrying out the main tasks, functions, authority and responsibilities entrusted to it by the public. In particular, responding to changes, demands, aspirations and interests that are always developing in society. In this way, all levels of society in the process of making laws and regulations have the widest possible opportunity to provide input. Apart from that, the formation of regional

¹⁸Ni'matul Huda. (2006). The Position of Regional Regulations in the Hierarchy of Legislative Regulations, *Law Journal*, 13 (1).

¹⁹ Dedi Kusmana, (2017), Kualitas Pelayanan Pemerintahan Desa Dalam Implementasi Undang-Undang No. 6 Tahun 2014 Di Desa Nagarawangi Kecamatan Rancakalong Kabupaten Sumedang Provinsi Jawa Barat, *Transformasi* Vol.IX/No.1/2017, 92

regulations can act as guardians and protectors in order to create peace and be able to realize community welfare.²⁰ The pluralistic Indonesian nation (diversity) upholds the principle of kinship and the principle of Unity in Diversity and remains the principle of the unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia, so every material contained in regional regulations must pay attention to the diversity of population, religion, ethnicity and group, regional and cultural conditions, especially those concerning issues. -sensitive issues in social, national and state life. Regional Regulation in its implementation, it is hoped that it will be able to protect justice, This means that regional regulations must reflect equality of justice in a professional manner for every citizen without exception. Because if a regional regulation contains things that differentiate backgrounds such as religion, race, ethnicity, class, gender or social status, it will cause chaos in society. In making this Regional Regulation there were several obstacles to the process of community participation, including ²¹: 1. Insufficient scope of government outreach. As we all know from the explanation previously outlined, in response to community participation in the process of drafting regional regulations (Raperda), things will be found that will hinder the process of community participation. The lack of scope for socialization from the government to the community is what is one of the inhibiting factors for community participation in the process of drafting regional regulations ; 2. Lack of Community Understanding. The factor of public knowledge which does not properly understand the substance of the Draft

Regional Regulation that will be proposed is the next obstacle that occurs compared to community participation in the process of drafting regional regulations. In forming regional regulations, community participation is very important to convey their aspirations in drafting laws, but most of the community does not really understand the meaning of forming regional regulations; 3. Low public awareness of participation. In this case, a factor that is no less important as an obstacle to community participation in the process of drafting regional regulations is the community itself, the low awareness of the community to participate directly in the process of drafting regional regulations. People sometimes tend not to care about their rights. The right as an object or even as a subject of a regional regulation to participate. Besides that, the public is reluctant to participate in the process of drafting regional regulations. The process of forming regional regulations is often not transparent so that regional regulations in some regions do not yet have full local content or fulfillment of legal protection for the traditional rights of the region and in some regions the regional legislation program is just a formality to provide legal certainty for the administration of government in general so it has not answered local community aspirations in the form of regional regulations.

CONCLUSION

From the description above it can be concluded as follows:

1. In forming regional regulations, the aspirations desired by the community must of course be balanced with community involvement, namely, among others:
 1. Involvement in drafting regional regulations;
 2. Involvement in the process of discussing regional regulations;
 3. Involvement in the

²⁰ Joko Riskiyono, (2015). Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Perundang-Undangan Untuk Mewujudkan Kesejahteraan, *Aspirasi* Vol.VI/No.2/2015, 160

²¹ Sarah Malena AD et al. Op. cit, 8

implementation of regional regulations.

2. The implementation of regional regulations in realizing prosperity, namely in each province and district or city, can be interpreted as community service. The service here is that the regional government must be able to create conditions that make it possible to develop community creativity in order to achieve shared prosperity. In the process of making laws and regulations, especially in this case the process of making regional regulations, all levels of society have the widest opportunity to provide input. Apart from that, the community also hopes that the formation of a Regional Regulation can become a guardian and protector in order to create peace in the community and be able to realize the prosperity that the community dreams of.

REFERENCES

Book

- Azhary, H. M. T. 2010. *Suatu Studi Negara Hukum tentang Prinsip-Prinsipnya Dilihat dari Segi Hukum Islam* : Implementasinya pada Periode Negara Madinah dan Masa Kini, Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Marzuki, P. M. 2007. *Legal Research* . Jakarta : Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Soekanto, S. 1993. *Sociology Dictionary* . Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Soerjono, Abdurahman, H. 2003. *Legal Research Methods* . Jakarta : Rineka Cipta.
- Soetrisno, L. 1995. *Towards a Participatory Society* . Yogyakarta: Kanisius.

Wiyono, S. 2018. *Reactualization of Pancasila in National and State Life* .Malang: Wisnuwardhana University Malang Press.

Yahya, Ahmad, Yein, et al. 2016. *Legislative Drafting Legislative Drafting* . Yogyakarta: Thafa Media.

Yusup, A. W. 2008. *Glorifying Just Law in the Realm of Just Democracy (In Points of Thought in Law; Commemorating 70 years of Prof. Dr. Arief Sidharta, SH)* . Bandung: Refika Aditama.

Journal Article

- Dani, R. Pinasang, Toar, N. Palilingan. 2023. Penerapan Prinsip Partisipasi Masyarakat Bermakna (*Meaningful Participation*) Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah, *Lex Privatum* Vol.XI/No.2/2023, 5.
- Huda, N. M. 2006. The Position of Regional Regulations in the Hierarchy of Legislative Regulations, *Law Journal* , 13 (1).
- Kusmana, D. 2017. Kualitas Pelayanan Pemerintahan Desa Dalam Implementasi Undang-Undang No. 6 Tahun 2014 Di Desa Nagarawangi Kecamatan Rancakalong Kabupaten Sumedang Provinsi Jawa Barat, *Transformasi* Vol.IX/No.1/2017, 92
- Malena, S. 2023. Application of the Principle of Meaningful Community Participation in the Formation of Regional Regulations. *Lex Privatum* Vol.XI/No.2/2023, 7.
- Praptanugraha. 2008. Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah, *Jurnal Hukum* Vol. XV/No.3/2008, 470.
- Riskiyono, J. 2015. Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Perundang-Undangan Untuk Mewujudkan Kesejahteraan, *Aspirasi* Vol.VI/No.2/2015, 160

Sari, R., Najicha, F. U. 2022. Memahami Nilai-Nilai Pancasila Sebagai Dasar Negara Dalam Kehidupan Masyarakat. *Jurnal Harmony* Vol.7/No.1/2022, 55.

Sumartini, S., Nurwahyuni., Kholik, S. 2022. Kedudukan Hukum Dalam Persepektif Negara Hukum Modern. *Jurnal Suara Hukum* Vol.IV/No.2/2023, 226.

SY, H. C., & Irawan, S. P. 2022. Expansion Meaning of Public Participation in the Formation of Laws After Decision of Constitutional Court, *Jurnal Konstitusi* Vol XIX/No.4/2022, 767.

Legal Documents

The 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia.

Law Number 13 of 2022 concerning the Second Amendment to Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations.

Internet

Isbandi Rukminto Adi, Kesejahteraan sosial: pekerjaan sosial, pembangunan sosial, dan kajian pembangunan. diakses pada 01 Maret 2024 pada 16.25 WIB.